

## C-separated sets and unicoherence

by

R. F. Dickman, Jr. and L. R. Rubin (Blacksburg, Va.)

Abstract. We say that a subset A of a topological space X is C-separated provided there exist disjoint closed and connected sets H and K of X such that  $A \subset (H \cup K)$  and A meets both H and K. A connected space X has Property C provided that every separated closed set is C-separated. In this paper we give a conjecture concerning unicoherence for locally connected, connected normal spaces and show it is equivalent to a special case of a conjecture of A. H. Stone. We show that our conjecture holds in spaces which have Property C. As the major result of this paper we show that every locally connected, connected Lindelöf Hausdorff space has Property C.

1. Definitions and terminology. Let X be a topological space. By a continuum of X we mean a non-empty closed and connected subset of X and by a region we mean an open and connected set. Note that a continuum is not necessarily compact. A set  $A \subset X$  is conditionally compact provided  $\overline{A}$  is compact.

A set  $A \subset X$  is C-separated provided there exist disjoint continua H and K of X such that  $A \subset (H \cup K)$  and  $A \cap H \neq \emptyset \neq A \cap K$ . We say X has  $Property\ C$  provided that every separated closed subset of X is C-separated. Recall that X is unicoherent if whenever  $X = H \cup K$  where H and K are continua,  $H \cap K$  is a continuum. Definitions not given herein may be found in [2] or [7].

- **2. Some conjectures.** In [5] A. D. Wallace proved that a Peano continuum S is multicoherent (i.e., not unicoherent) if and only if there exist continua  $S_1$ ,  $S_2$ , and  $S_3$  of S such that  $S = S_1 \cup S_2 \cup S_3$  and for  $i, j \in \{1, 2, 3\}$ ,  $S_i \cap S_j \neq \emptyset$  while  $S_1 \cap S_2 \cap S_3 = \emptyset$ . A. H. Stone has made the following conjecture:
- \*) Let X be a locally connected, connected normal space and let n > 2 be an integer. If X is not unicoherent, X can be expressed as the union of n continua  $A_1, A_2, ..., A_n$  whose nerve is a closed n-gon (i.e., with indices taken mod n,  $A_i$  meets  $A_{i-1}$  and  $A_{i+1}$  and no others and no three of these sets have a non-empty intersection).



In [4] Stone proved (\*) for n=3. He also has established that (\*) is true when X is finitely coherent or when X is compact.

We offer the following conjecture:

(\*\*) Let X be a locally connected, connected normal space. Then X is unicoherent if and only if for each disjoint pair  $\{A, B\}$  of continua of X there exists a continuum C of X such that C separates A and B in X.

In a private communication A. H. Stone reported his conjecture to us and at the same time he stated that he believed that (\*) for n=4 was equivalent to (\*\*).

LEMMA 1. Let X be a unicoherent, locally connected, connected normal space and let A and B be disjoint continua of X. Then there exists a continuum C of X that separates A and B in X.

Proof. This follows from a well-known characterization of unicoherence. See [7, pp. 47-49].

Theorem 1. Let X be a locally connected, connected normal space. Then (\*) for n=4 is equivalent to (\*\*).

Proof. Suppose that (\*) for n=4 holds. By Lemma 1 we need only show that if every pair of disjoint continua of X can be separated by a continuum in X, then X is unicoherent. Suppose to the contrary that X is not unicoherent. Then by (\*) there exist continua  $A_1, A_2, A_3, A_4$  such that  $X=\bigcup A_i, A_i \cap A_j \neq \emptyset$  if and only if  $|i(\bmod 4)-j(\bmod 4)| \leqslant 1$ , and no three of the  $A_i$ 's have a non-empty intersection. By our assumption there exists a continuum G such that G separates G and G meets each of the continua G and G meets each of the continua G and G meets each of the continual G and G meets each of the G meets each of G meets

Now suppose (\*\*) is true and X is not unicoherent. Then by (\*\*) there exist disjoint continua A' and B' in X such that no continuum of X separates A' and B' in X. Let  $A_0$  and  $B_0$  be disjoint continua such that A' is interior to  $A_0$  and B' is interior to  $B_0$ . Now if  $X \setminus A_0$  is connected, let  $A = A_0$ ; if  $X \setminus A_0$  is not connected let U be the component of  $X \setminus A_0$  that contains  $B_0$  and in this case let  $A = X \setminus U$ . In either case A' is interior to A,  $A \cap B_0 = \emptyset$  and  $X \setminus A$  is connected. In a similar fashion we can find a continuum B such that B' is interior to B,  $A \cap B = \emptyset$  and  $X \setminus B$  is connected. Let  $T = X \setminus (A \cup B)$  and note that  $\overline{T}$  is not connected. For otherwise  $\overline{T}$  would be a continuum separating A' and B'. Thus  $\overline{T} = H \cup K$  where H and K are disjoint non-empty closed sets. Let P denote the union of the components of T which lie in H and let Q denote the union of the components of T which lie in K. Observe that since neither A nor B separates X, and X is locally connected, then the closure of every com-

ponent of T meets both A and B. Thus  $Z=A\cup Q\cup B$  and  $Y=A\cup \cup P\cup B$  are continua. Furthermore note that Y is locally connected (in the relative topology of Y) at every point of  $\overline{P}$ . Let R be any open subset of X containing A such that  $\overline{R}\cap B=\emptyset$  and let F denote the frontier of R relative to Y. Let L be the component of  $Y\setminus F$  containing A and let M be the component of  $Y\setminus \overline{L}$  containing B. Finally let  $D_1=Y\setminus M$  and  $D_2=\overline{M}$ . Then  $D_1$  and  $D_2$  are continua,  $A\subset \operatorname{Int}_Y D_1$ ,  $B\subset \operatorname{Int}_Y D_2$ ,  $Y=D_1\cup D_2$  and  $D_1\cap D_2\subset F\subset Y\setminus (A\cup B)$ . Repeat the above construction for Z and obtain continua  $D_3$  and  $D_4$  such that  $A\subset \operatorname{Int}_Z D_4$ ,  $B\subset \operatorname{Int}_Z D_3$ ,  $Z=D_3\cup D_4$  and  $D_3\cap D_4\subset Z\setminus (A\cup B)$ . Then  $X=D_1\cup D_2\cup D_3\cup D_4$  is the desired representation of X.

LEMMA 2. If X is a connected space, X has Property C, and every disjoint pair of continua of X can be separated by a connected subset of X, then X is unicoherent.

Proof. Suppose  $X = H \cup K$  where H and K are continua and  $H \cap K$  is separated. Since  $H \cap K$  is also closed and X has Property C, there exist disjoint continua C and D such that  $H \cap K \subset (C \cup D)$  and  $C \cap (H \cap K) \neq \emptyset \neq D \cap (H \cap K)$ . By hypothesis there exists a connected subset M of X such that M separates C and D in X. But this implies M meets each of the separated sets  $H \setminus (C \cup D)$  and  $K \setminus (C \cup D)$ , and since M is contained in their union, M is not connected. This contradiction proves the Lemma.

The next theorem is obtained from Lemmas 1 and 2.

THEOREM 2. If X is a locally connected, connected normal space which has Property C, then X is unicoherent if and only if every pair of disjoint continua in X can be separated by a connected subset of X.

3. C-separated sets and Property C. In this section we establish some basic properties of C-separated sets.

LEMMA 3. Let A and B be subsets of X, suppose  $A \subset B$  and that every component of B contains a component of A. Then if B is C-separated so also is A.

The proof follows easily from the definitions involved.

Lemma 4. Let X be locally connected, connected and normal. If A is a separated closed subset of X and A has only finitely many components then A is C-separated.

Proof. Let  $Q_1, ..., Q_n$  be the components of A and let  $V_1, ..., V_n$  be a collection of regions such that for  $i, j \in \{1, ..., n\}$ ,  $Q_i \subset V_i$  and  $\overline{V}_i \cap \overline{V}_j = \emptyset$  if  $i \neq j$ . Let  $\{W_a\}$ ,  $\alpha \in \Gamma$ , be a covering of  $X \setminus A$  by regions no one of which intersects more than one  $\overline{V}_i$ . Let  $K = \{V_i\}_{j=1}^n \cup \{W_a\}_{a \in \Gamma}$  and let S be a simple chain [7, p. 33] of elements of K from  $Q_1$  to  $Q_2$  and let  $S_1$  be the subchain of S such that  $S_1$  contains  $V_1$  and exactly one  $V_i$  different from  $V_1$ .



Let Q' denote the closure of the union of the links of  $S_1$ . Then  $B = \bigcup \{Q_i : Q_i \cap Q' = \emptyset\} \cup Q'$  is a separated set with n-1 components and every component of B contains a component of A. The result now follows by induction.

LEMMA 5. Let X be a locally compact, locally connected Hausdorff space and suppose A is a compact subset of a region V of X. Then there is a continuum L of X with  $A \subset L \subset V$ .

The proof of this lemma is routine.

Lemma 6. Let A be a closed, disconnected subset of a locally connected, connected Hausdorff space X. Then if A has a component Q having a compact neighborhood, A is C-separated.

Proof. Let V be a conditionally compact region of X such that  $Q \subset V$ ,  $\operatorname{Fr} V \cap A = \emptyset$ , and  $A \subset V$ . Choose V so that  $\overline{V}$  has a compact neighborhood. Let W be a conditionally compact neighborhood of  $\overline{V}$  such that  $\operatorname{Fr} W \cap A = \emptyset$  and  $W \cap A = V \cap A$ . Let S denote the set of complementary domains of  $\overline{V}$ . If  $U \in S$  and  $U \cap A \neq \emptyset$ , then  $U \cap \nabla \operatorname{Fr} W \neq \emptyset$ . Since S is a pairwise disjoint set and S is an open cover of the compact set  $\operatorname{Fr} W$ , there is a finite set, say  $\{S_1, S_2, ..., S_n\}$ , of elements of S that covers  $\operatorname{Fr} W$ . Thus  $A \subset (\bigcup S_i) \cup V$ . Applying Lemma 5, there is a continuum C of C with C of C v. Let C is a continuum C of C with C of C v. Let C is C in C and C and at least one other component of C intersects C in fact, C is and C and at least one other component of C intersects C in fact, C is C separated since C has only finitely many components.

DEFINITION. A continuous function f of X onto a space Y is non-alternating provided that for every  $y \in Y$ , if  $X \setminus f^{-1}(y) = H \cup K$  is a separation, then  $f(H) \cap f(K) = \emptyset$  [6, p. 127]. When Y = [0, 1], a continuous surjection  $f: X \to Y$  is non-alternating provided for every  $y \in (0, 1), X \setminus f^{-1}(y)$  has exactly two components [1, Lemma 1].

LEMMA 7. Let X be a locally connected, connected normal space. Then X has Property C if and only if for every pair of disjoint non-empty closed sets A and B of X there exists a non-alternating map  $f: X \rightarrow [0, 1]$  such that  $f(A \cup B) = \{0, 1\}$ .

This is Lemma 4 and Remark 5 of [1].

\* 4. C-separation in locally compact Lindelöf spaces. In this section we prove the major result of this paper.

Suppose U is an open subset of a space X; C, D,  $Q_1$ , ...,  $Q_n$  are continua in X that meet U; and B is a closed subset of X contained in U such that  $B \cup C \cup D \cup Q_1 \cup ... \cup Q_n = C_1 \cup D_1$  where  $C_1$  and  $D_1$  are disjoint continua,  $C \subset C_1$  and  $D \subset D_1$ . Then we say  $(C_1, D_1)$  is a division of  $\bigcup Q_i$  in U relative to (C, D).

LEMMA 8. Let X be a locally connected regular space, U be a region of X, and  $\{C, D, Q_1, ..., Q_n\}$  be a pairwise disjoint set of continua of X all intersecting U. Then there exists a division  $(C_1, D_1)$  of  $\bigcup Q_i$  in U relative to (C, D).

Proof. Let E be a covering of U by regions such that for each  $V \in E$ ,  $\overline{V} \subset U$  and  $\overline{V}$  meets at most one element of  $\{C, D, Q_1, ..., Q_n\}$ . Let  $\{V_1, ..., V_r\}$  be a simple chain of elements of E from  $Q_1$  to  $C \cup D$ . Choose s so that  $\overline{V}_s$  is the first element of  $\{\overline{V}_1, ..., \overline{V}_r\}$  that intersects  $C \cup D$ , say  $\overline{V}_s$  intersects C. Then no element of  $\{\overline{V}_1, ..., \overline{V}_s\}$  intersects C. Let  $\{Q'_1, ..., Q'_n\}$  be the members of  $\{Q_1, ..., Q_n\}$  which intersect  $\overline{V}_1 \cup \overline{V}_2 \cup ... \cup \overline{V}_s$ . Then let  $C' = C \cup \overline{V}_1 \cup ... \cup \overline{V}_s \cup Q'_1 \cup ... \cup Q'_s$ . We see that C' is a continuum,  $Q_1 \cup C \subset C'$  and  $C' \cap D = \emptyset$ . With C' replacing C, we proceed by induction.

LEMMA 9. Let X be a locally connected, paracompact Hausdorff space and F be a closed subspace of X having the property that X is locally compact at each point of F. Then there exists a collection  $\{R_a\}$  of conditionally compact regions of X covering F, such that  $\{R_a \cap F\}$  is a locally finite subset of X and each  $R_a \cap F$  intersects at most finitely many elements of  $\{R_a \cap F\}$ .

Proof. We see that F is a locally compact, paracompact subspace of X. By [2, XI.7.3] F is a free union  $\{F_{\beta}\}$  of  $\sigma$ -compact spaces. Let  $F_{\beta} \in \{F_{\beta}\}$  and using [2, XI.7.2] write  $F_{\beta} = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} U_i$  where  $U_i$  is open in  $F_{\beta}$ ,  $\overline{U}_i$  is compact, and  $\overline{U}_i \subset U_{i+1}$ . Let  $U_{-1} = U_0 = \emptyset$ . We then write  $F_{\beta} = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} (U_i \backslash U_{i-1})$ . For each  $i \geq 1$  there is a finite open cover  $\{R_1^i, R_2^i, \dots, R_{nl}^i\}$  of  $\overline{U}_i \backslash U_{i-1}$  where each  $R_j^i$  is a conditionally compact region of X and  $R_j^i \cap F_{\beta} = R_j^i \cap F \subset U_{i+1} \backslash \overline{U}_{i-2}$ . It is clear that  $\{R_j^i \cap F_j = \{R_j^i \cap F_{\beta}\}$  is a locally finite subset of  $F_{\beta}$  and hence of X because  $F_{\beta}$  is closed in X. Furthermore  $R_j^i \cap F_{\beta}$  can meet  $R_m^k \cap F_{\beta}$  only if  $i-1 \leq k \leq i+1$ . So each  $R_j^i \cap F_{\beta} = R_j^i \cap F$  intersects at most finitely many elements of  $\{R_j^i \cap F_j\}$ . Let us construct such open sets  $\{R_j^i\}$  for each  $F_{\beta}$ , and call the totality of these sets  $\{R_a\}$ . Then  $\{R_a\}$  satisfies the required conditions.

LEMMA 10. Let X be a paracompact, locally connected, connected Hausdorff space and suppose P is a countable, discrete, closed subspace of X. If  $X \setminus P$  is locally compact, then P is C-separated.

Proof. Let  $\{P_i|\ i=1,2,\ldots\}$  be a countable, locally finite collection of open subsets of X with pairwise disjoint closures and such that for each  $i,\ P_i$  contains exactly one element of P. If  $\{\overline{P}_i\}$  is C-separated then so is P; we shall prove  $\{\overline{P}_i\}$  is C-separated.

By Lemma 9 there exists a collection  $\{R_a\}$  of relatively compact regions of X covering  $F = X \setminus \bigcup P_i$  such that  $\{R_a \cap F\}$  is a locally finite



subset of X and each  $R_{\alpha} \cap F$  intersects at most finitely many elements of  $\{R \cap F\}$ . We note that if  $Y \subset X$  can be written as a union of a collection  $\{Y_{\beta}\}$  of closed subsets of F such that each  $R_{\alpha}$  intersects at most finitely many  $Y_{\beta}$ , then  $\{Y_{\beta}\}$  is locally finite and hence Y is closed in X [2, III.9.2].

Since  $\{P_i\}$  is countable,  $\{P_i\} \cup \{R_a\}$  is an open cover of X, and X is connected, there is a countable subset, say  $\{R_i\}$  of  $\{R_a\}$  such that  $(\bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} P_i) \cup \{R_a\}$ 

 $\cup$  ( $\bigcup_{1}^{\infty}R_{i}$ ) is connected. Each  $P_{j}$  must intersect at least one  $R_{i}$  and since each  $R_{i}$  is conditionally compact, it can intersect only finitely many  $P_{j}$ . Let  $C_{0} = \overline{P}_{1}$  and  $D_{0} = \overline{P}_{2}$ . Let  $S_{1}$  be the first element of  $\{R_{i}\}$  that intersects  $C_{0} \cup D_{0}$ . Let  $A_{1} = \{\overline{P}_{j} | \overline{P}_{j} \not\subset C_{0} \cup D_{0}$  and  $\overline{P}_{j} \cap S_{1} \neq \emptyset\}$ . Let  $(C_{1}, D_{1})$  be a division of  $A_{1}$  in  $S_{1}$  relative to  $(C_{0}, D_{0})$ , which is possible by Lemma 8. Thus  $C_{1}$  is the union of  $C_{0}$ , elements of  $\{\overline{P}_{j}\}$ , and a closed subset  $C'_{1}$  of X with  $C'_{1} \subset S_{1} \cap F$ . Similarly  $D_{1}$  is the union of  $D_{0}$ , elements of  $\{\overline{P}_{j}\}$ , and a closed subset  $D'_{1}$  of X with  $D'_{1} \subset S_{1} \cap F$ .

Now suppose  $A_n,\,C_n,\,D_n,\,C_n',\,D_n',\,S_n$  have been chosen. Let  $S_{n+1}$  be the first element of  $\{R_i\} \backslash \{S_1,S_2,\ldots,S_n\}$  that intersects  $C_n \cup D_n$ . Let  $A_{n+1} = \{\overline{P}_j | \ \overline{P}_j \not\subset C_n \cup D_n \ \text{and} \ \overline{P}_j \cap S_{n+1} \neq \emptyset\}$ . Let  $(C_{n+1},D_{n+1})$  be a division of  $A_{n+1}$  in  $S_{n+1}$  relative to  $(C_n,D_n)$ . Thus  $C_{n+1}$  is the union of  $C_n$ , elements of  $\{\overline{P}_j\}$  and a closed subset  $C_{n+1}'$  of X with  $C_{n+1}' \subset S_{n+1} \cap F$ . Similarly  $D_{n+1}$  is the union of elements of  $\{\overline{P}_j\}$ ,  $D_n$ , and a closed subset  $D_{n+1}' \subset S_{n+1} \cap F$ .

Let  $C = \bigcup C_i$  and  $D = \bigcup D_i$ . Then  $C \cap D = \emptyset$ , C and D are connected, and  $\overline{P}_1 \subset C$  and  $\overline{P}_2 \subset D$ . By a straightforward inductive argument it can be proved that  $\bigcup \overline{P}_i \subset C \cup D$ . If we can prove C and D are closed in X, the proof will be complete.

But C can be written as  $(\bigcup C_i') \cup B$  where B is the union of a collection of elements of  $\{\overline{P}_i\}$ . Thus B is closed. Now each  $R_a$  can intersect at most finitely many elements of  $\{C_i'\}$  because each  $C_i' \subset S_i \cap F$ ,  $S_i \in \{R_a\}$ , and  $R_a \cap F$  intersects at most finitely many elements of  $\{R_a \cap F\}$ . Thus by a previous remark,  $\bigcup C_i'$  is a closed subset of X. Therefore C is closed. By a similar argument D is closed. The proof is complete.

LEMMA 11. Let X be a locally compact, locally connected, Lindelöf, Hausdorff space and suppose A is a disconnected closed subset of X. Then there exists a closed neighborhood B of A whose components form a locally finite set of at least two and at most countably many elements each of which intersects A.

Proof. Let  $A = H \cup K$  where H and K are disjoint, non-empty closed sets. Since X is locally compact and Hausdorff, X is regular; and this condition along with the Lindelöf property implies X is paracompact and hence normal. Furthermore there is a sequence  $\{V_i\}$  of conditionally

compact open subsets of X such that  $X = \bigcup V_i$  and for each  $i, \overline{V}_i \subset V_{i+1}$  [2, XI.7.2].

Using the normality, let E and F be open sets with  $\overline{E} \cap \overline{F} = \emptyset$ ,  $H \subset E$  and  $K \subset F$ . Let  $V_0 = V_{-1} = \emptyset$ . For each i > 0, let  $A_i = A \cap (\overline{V}_i \vee V_{i-1})$ . Let  $B_i$  be the closure of a finite union of conditionally compact regions such that every component of  $B_i$  meets  $A_i$  and  $A_i \subset \operatorname{Int} B_i \subset B_i$   $\subset (V_{i+1} \vee \overline{V}_{i-2}) \cap (E \cup F)$ . Define  $B = \bigcup B_i$ . It is routine to check that B satisfies the required conditions.

THEOREM 3. Let X be a locally compact, locally connected, connected, Lindelöf, Hausdorff space. Then X has Property C.

Proof. Let A be a separated closed subset of X. By Lemma 11 there is a closed set B containing A such that the components of B form a locally finite set of at least two and at most countably many elements each of which intersects A. If B has only finitely many components, then, applying Lemmas 3 and 4, A is C-separated. Thus, suppose B has a countable number of components.

Let G be the decomposition of X obtained from the relation, x is equivalent to y if and only if x and y are in the same component of B. Since the set of components of B is locally finite, G is upper semicontinuous. Thus the quotient map  $p\colon X\to X/G$  is a closed map. By Theorem VIII.6.5 of [2], we know that X is paracompact and that since p is closed, X/G is paracompact and Hausdorff. The quotient map p is monotone, X/G is connected and locally connected, and X/G is locally compact outside the countable, closed, discrete subspace p(B). By Lemma 10, p(B) is C-separated. Under a monotone identification the inverse image of a connected set is connected. Therefore B is C-separated and the proof is complete.

In the following we shall use implicitly results and terminology from [3]. By a polyhedron we mean a space homeomorphic to the space |K| of a simplicial complex K. We note that although every polyhedron is paracompact and Hausdorff, polyhedra need not be locally compact or Lindelöf.

THEOREM 4. Every connected polyhedron has Property C.

Proof. Let X be a connected polyhedron and assume X=|K| where K is a simplicial complex. Suppose A is a disconnected, closed subset of X. Let H and K be disjoint closed and non-empty sets such that  $A=H\cup K$ . Since X is paracompact it is normal, so let E and F be neighborhoods of H and K respectively such that  $E\cap F=\emptyset$ . There exists a subdivision L of K such that every simplex of L that meets A is contained in  $E\cup F$ . Let  $C_H$  be the subcomplex of L consisting of all simplexes of L that intersect H and all faces of such simplexes; let  $C_K$  be defined similarly for K. Then  $H \subset |C_H| \subset E$  and  $K \subset |C_K| \subset F$ .



Let  $C_0$  be a component of  $C_H$  and  $D_0$  be a component of  $C_K$ . Let  $\mathfrak M$  be the set of all ordered pairs  $(M,\,M_0)$  such that M is a component of  $C_H \cup C_K$  and  $M_0$  is a closed path in L intersecting M and  $C_0$  but not intersecting  $D_0$ . Let C be the union of all the subcomplexes of L which are elements of an ordered pair of  $\mathfrak M$ . Then C is connected,  $C_0 \subset C$ , and  $C \cap D_0 = \mathscr O$ . Now if M is a component of  $C_H \cup C_K$  and there is not a closed path in L intersecting  $D_0$  and M but not  $C_0$ , then there is a closed path  $M_0$  in C intersecting C0 and C0 but not intersecting C0. Thus, let C1 be the set of all ordered pairs C1, C2, and that C3 is a component of C4, and C5 is a closed path in C6 intersecting C7. Let C8 be the union of all the subcomplexes of C8 which are elements of an ordered pair of C8. Then C9 is connected, C9 and C9 and C9 and C9.

We see that every component of  $C_H \cup C_K$  is either in C or D. Since C and D are connected subcomplexes of L, both |C| and |D| are continua of X. Since  $C \cap D = \emptyset$ ,  $|C| \cap |D| = \emptyset$ . But  $A = H \cup K \subset |C| \cap |D|$  and  $|C| \cap H \neq \emptyset \neq K \cap |D|$ . Therefore A is C-separated.

COROLLARY. Let X be a connected polyhedron or a locally connected, connected, Lindelöf, locally compact Hausdorff space. Then the following are equivalent.

- a. X is unicoherent.
- b. Every pair of disjoint continua in X can be separated by a connected set.

If in addition X is separable, then using Theorem 2 of [1], (a) and (b) are equivalent to:

c. For every pair of disjoint non-empty closed sets A and B of X there exists a continuous function f of X onto [0,1] such that  $f(A \cup B) = \{0,1\}$  and for some dense subset D of [0,1],  $f^{-1}(d)$  is connected for every  $d \in D$ .

Remark. Recently the authors have obtained an example of a locally connected, connected separable metric space that fails to have Property C. They also have an example of a connected CW-complex that fails to have Property C.

## References

- R. F. Dickman, Jr., Some mapping characterizations of unicoherence, Fund. Math. 78 (1973), pp. 27-35.
- [2] J. Dugundji, Topology, 1968.
- [3] E. H. Spanier, Algebraic Topology, 1966.
- [4] A. H. Stone, Incidence relations in unicoherent spaces, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 65 (1948), pp. 427-447.

- [5] A. D. Wallace, A characterization of unicoherence, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc., Abstract 345, 48 (1942).
- [6] G. T. Whyburn, Analytic Topology, Amer. Math. Soc. Coll. Publ. 1955.
- [7] R. L. Wilder, Topology of Manifolds, Amer. Math. Soc. Coll. Publ. 1963.

VIRGINIA POLYTECHNIC INSTITUTE AND STATE UNIVERSITY THE UNIVERSITY OF OKLAHOMA

Reçu par la Rédaction le 21. 4. 1972