

## On convex metric spaces IV

by

A. Lelek and Jan Mycielski (Wrocław)

**§ 1. Introduction.** The classical Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem says that every bounded closed subset of the Euclidean space is compact; in the present paper we prove and extend the following generalization:

*Every bounded closed subset of a convex complete locally compact metric space is compact.*

This form of the generalized Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem has been announced in [3]. We adopt the notation from [1]. Suppose that  $(X, \rho)$  is a complete locally compact metric space. Some purely metric conditions are necessary in order that the Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem hold for  $(X, \rho)$ . Indeed, the real line with the metric  $\text{Min}\{1, |x-y|\}$  constitutes an example of a bounded complete locally compact metric space which is neither compact nor convex. A theorem below (see § 2) relaxes the condition of convexity, which is replaced by the concept of almost star-like metrization. Our considerations have arisen from a paper by C. Ryll-Nardzewski [4] and are related to some ideas which he has expressed; this is needed for a generalization of certain results of [2] and [4].

As a consequence of the Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem for almost star-like metric spaces we obtain (see § 3) the existence of metric segments joining an arbitrary point with a point in the space. During a seminar discussion Dr. Nitka observed that if a metric space  $(X, \rho)$  satisfies the latter condition, then in order to have the Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem for  $(X, \rho)$  it is enough to assume that  $(X, \rho)$  is complete and peripherally compact, i.e. that there exists an open basis consisting of sets whose boundaries are compact. However, we do not know whether the Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem is true for every almost star-like complete peripherally compact metric space.

At the end of the paper (see § 4) we give a rather paradoxical example of a metric space in connection with the concept of convexity.

**§ 2. The generalized Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem.** A metric space  $(X, \rho)$  is called *star-like* at a point  $o \in X$  if for each  $q \in X$ , and each  $\theta$  satisfying  $0 \leq \theta \leq \rho(o, q)$ , there exists  $p \in X$  such that

$$\rho(o, p) = \theta = \rho(o, q) - \rho(p, q).$$

A metric space  $(X, \varrho)$  is called *almost star-like* at a point  $o \in X$  if for each  $q \in X$ , and each  $\theta$  satisfying  $0 \leq \theta \leq \varrho(o, q)$ , and each  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists  $p \in X$  such that

$$\varrho(o, p) - \varepsilon \leq \theta \leq \varrho(o, q) - \varrho(p, q) + \varepsilon.$$

We denote by  $B(t)$  the ball  $\{x: \varrho(o, x) \leq t\}$ , and by  $t_0$  the supremum of real numbers  $t$  such that the ball  $B(t)$  is totally bounded ( $0 \leq t_0 < \infty$ ).

2.1. *If a metric space  $(X, \varrho)$  is almost star-like at  $o \in X$ , and  $t_0 < \infty$ , then each infinite set  $Y \subset B(t_0 + 1/n)$  contains an infinite subset  $Z$  with a diameter  $\delta(Z) \leq 7/n$ .*

*Proof.* In the case  $t_0 = 0$  we put  $Z = Y$ . Assuming  $t_0 > 0$  we choose positive real numbers  $t', t''$  such that

$$t_0 - 1/n < t' < t'' < t_0.$$

The ball  $B(t')$  is totally bounded. If infinitely many points of  $Y$  are in  $B(t')$ , we easily find a suitable set  $Z$  because  $Y$  must then contain a Cauchy sequence. If that is not so, let us take different points  $q_i \in Y \setminus B(t')$  where  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ . Since the space is almost star-like at  $o$ , we get points  $p_i \in X$  such that

$$\varrho(o, p_i) - (t'' - t') \leq t' \leq \varrho(o, q_i) - \varrho(p_i, q_i) + (t'' - t')$$

for  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ . Thus  $p_i \in B(t'')$  and

$$\varrho(p_i, q_i) \leq \varrho(o, q_i) + t'' - 2t' \leq t_0 + 1/n + t'' - 2t' < 3/n$$

for  $i = 1, 2, \dots$ . But  $B(t'')$  is also totally bounded. Consequently, there exists an infinite set  $I$  of positive integers such that  $\varrho(p_i, p_j) < 1/n$  for  $i, j \in I$ . We define  $Z = \{q_i: i \in I\}$ .

2.2. **THEOREM.** *If a complete locally compact metric space  $(X, \varrho)$  is almost star-like, then each bounded subset in  $(X, \varrho)$  is totally bounded.*

*Proof.* We have to prove that  $t_0 = \infty$ . Suppose on the contrary that  $t_0 < \infty$ . There exist numbers  $\varepsilon_n > 0$  and infinite sets  $Y_n \subset B(t_0 + 1/n)$  such that  $\varrho(p, q) > \varepsilon_n$  for  $p, q \in Y_n$  and  $p \neq q$  ( $n = 1, 2, \dots$ ). By 2.1, there exist infinite sets  $Z_n \subset Y_n$  such that  $\delta(Z_n) \leq 7/n$ . Let  $z_n \in Z_n$ . It follows from 2.1 that the sequence  $z_1, z_2, \dots$  must contain a Cauchy sequence. The latter converges to a point  $z \in X$ . Each neighbourhood of  $z$  contains one of the sets  $Z_n$ , which is impossible because  $X$  is locally compact.

The following examples refute some modifications of 2.2 which could be conjectured.

2.3. *There exist bounded convex metric spaces  $(X', \varrho')$  and  $(X'', \varrho'')$  such that (i)  $(X', \varrho')$  is locally compact but neither complete nor totally bounded, and (ii)  $(X'', \varrho'')$  is complete but neither locally compact nor totally bounded.*

*Proof.* Take plane sets

$$X' = \{(x, 0): 0 < x \leq 1\} \cup \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} \{(1/i, y): 0 \leq y \leq 1\},$$

$$X'' = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} \{(x, x/i): 0 \leq x \leq 1\}$$

with distances  $\varrho'(p, q)$ ,  $\varrho''(p, q)$  defined as the lengths of the arcs which join  $p$  and  $q$  in  $X'$ ,  $X''$ , respectively. Then conditions (i) and (ii) are satisfied.

**§ 3. Connectedness of almost star-like spaces.** The space of rational numbers with the ordinary metric is almost star-like at each point. Thus non-degenerate non-complete almost star-like spaces may even be zero-dimensional. Moreover, it will be shown in the next paragraph that there exists a non-degenerate zero-dimensional separable metric space which is star-like at each point.

3.1. *If a complete metric space  $(X, \varrho)$  is almost star-like at  $o \in A \subset X$ , then for each  $q \in X \setminus A$ , and each  $\eta > 0$ , there exists  $p \in \text{Fr} A$  such that*

$$\varrho(o, p) + \varrho(p, q) \leq \varrho(o, q) + \eta.$$

*Proof.* In the case  $\varrho(q, A) = 0$  we put  $p = q$ . Assuming  $\varrho(q, A) > 0$  we inductively define points  $p_0, p_1, \dots$  such that  $\varrho(p_n, A) > 0$  for  $n = 0, 1, \dots$ . Let  $p_0 = q$ . If  $n > 0$  and  $p_{n-1}$  is defined, then the positive numbers

$$\theta = \varrho(o, p_{n-1}) - \frac{1}{2} \varrho(p_{n-1}, A), \quad \varepsilon = \frac{1}{2} \text{Min}\{\theta, \eta/2^n, \varrho(p_{n-1}, A)\}$$

satisfy the inequality  $0 \leq \theta - \varepsilon \leq \varrho(o, p_{n-1})$ , and the space  $(X, \varrho)$  being almost star-like at  $o$ , we get a point  $p_n$  such that

$$\varrho(o, p_n) - \varepsilon \leq \theta - \varepsilon \leq \varrho(o, p_{n-1}) - \varrho(p_n, p_{n-1}) + \varepsilon.$$

This yields

$$(1) \quad \varrho(o, p_n) \leq \varrho(o, p_{n-1}) - \frac{1}{2} \varrho(p_{n-1}, A)$$

and

$$\varrho(p_n, p_{n-1}) \leq \varrho(o, p_{n-1}) - \theta + 2\varepsilon < \varrho(p_{n-1}, A),$$

whence  $\varrho(p_n, A) > 0$  and

$$(2) \quad \varrho(o, p_n) + \varrho(p_n, p_{n-1}) \leq \varrho(o, p_{n-1}) + \eta/2^n.$$

It follows from (1) that

$$\varrho(o, p_n) \leq \varrho(o, q) - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=0}^{n-1} \varrho(p_i, A)$$

and from (2) that

$$\varrho(o, p_n) + \varrho(p_n, q) \leq \varrho(o, q) + \sum_{i=1}^n \eta/2^i < \varrho(o, q) + \eta.$$

Consequently, we obtain

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \varrho(p_i, p_{i-1}) \leq \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \varrho(p_i, A) \leq 2\varrho(o, q) < \infty,$$

which means that  $p_0, p_1, \dots$  is a Cauchy sequence; let  $p$  be its limit. Since  $p_n \in X \setminus A$  and  $\varrho(p_i, A)$  converges to zero as  $i$  tends to infinity, the point  $p$  satisfies the conclusion of 3.1.

3.2. *Almost star-like complete metric spaces are connected.*

The following theorem gives more information than 3.2 for the class of locally compact spaces.

3.3. *If a complete locally compact metric space  $(X, \varrho)$  is almost star-like at  $o \in X$ , then each point  $q \in X \setminus \{o\}$  can be joined with  $o$  by a metric segment  $\overline{oq}$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $P_n$  be the finite set constructed as follows ( $n = 1, 2, \dots$ ). Put  $p_n^0 = q$  and take a point

$$p_n^m \in \text{Fr}B[(n-m)\varrho(o, q)/n]$$

such that

$$\varrho(o, p_n^m) + \varrho(p_n^m, p_n^{m-1}) \leq \varrho(o, p_n^{m-1}) + 1/n^2$$

according to 3.1 ( $m = 1, \dots, n$ ). Let  $P_n = \{p_n^0, \dots, p_n^n\}$ .

Clearly all sets  $P_n$  are contained in the ball  $B[\varrho(o, q) + 1]$ , which is compact by 2.2. Thus the sequence  $P_1, P_2, \dots$  has a convergent subsequence. Without loss of generality we can assume that the sequence  $P_1, P_2, \dots$  itself converges, and write

$$P = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} P_n.$$

It turns out that  $P$  is a segment  $\overline{oq}$ . Indeed, let us first notice that if  $p, p'$  are points of  $P_n$ , then

$$|\varrho(o, p) - \varrho(o, p')| \leq \varrho(p, p') \leq |\varrho(o, p) - \varrho(o, p')| + 1/n$$

( $n = 1, 2, \dots$ ). Hence  $P$  meets the boundary of each ball  $B(t)$ , where  $0 \leq t \leq \varrho(o, q)$ , at exactly one point, i.e. we have  $\text{Fr}B(t) \cap P = \{p_t\}$ . Furthermore, if  $0 \leq t < t' \leq \varrho(o, q)$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exist an integer  $n > 5/\varepsilon$  and points  $p, p' \in P_n$  such that  $\varrho(p, p_t) < \varepsilon/5$  and  $\varrho(p', p_{t'}) < \varepsilon/5$ .

This gives the inequalities

$$\varrho(p, p') - 2\varepsilon/5 < \varrho(p_t, p_{t'}) < \varrho(p, p') + 2\varepsilon/5,$$

$$|t - t'| - 2\varepsilon/5 < |\varrho(o, p) - \varrho(o, p')| < |t - t'| + 2\varepsilon/5,$$

because  $|\varrho(o, p_t) - \varrho(o, p_{t'})| = |t - t'|$ . Consequently, we obtain

$$|t - t'| - \varepsilon < \varrho(p_t, p_{t'}) < |t - t'| + \varepsilon,$$

which implies  $\varrho(p_t, p_{t'}) = |t - t'|$ . The set  $P$  is thus isometric with a segment of the real line, and so  $P = \overline{oq}$ .

**§ 4. An example of metric space.** We start with a construction of a set on the plane  $E^2$ . We denote by  $L$  the collection of all straight lines  $\{(x, y): x = a\}$  and  $\{(x, y): y = a\}$ , and by  $M$  the collection of all straight lines  $\{(x, y): y = x + a\}$  and  $\{(x, y): y = -x + a\}$ , where  $a$  is an arbitrary real number.

4.1. *There exists a set  $X \subset E^2$  such that  $L \cap X$  contains one point or is empty, and  $M \cap X$  is dense in  $M$ , for every  $L \in L$  and  $M \in M$ .*

*Proof.* Denote by  $\gamma$  the minimum ordinal of cardinality continuum. Let  $\{J_\alpha: \alpha < \gamma\}$  be the collection of all intervals of lines from  $M$ . We define points  $p_\alpha \in J_\alpha$  inductively. Let  $p_1$  be a point of  $J_1$ , and suppose that points  $p_\alpha$  are defined for  $\alpha < \beta$  where  $\beta < \gamma$ . The set  $Q$  of points at which the lines  $L \in L$  passing through  $p_\alpha$  ( $\alpha < \beta$ ) intersect  $J_\beta$  is of cardinality less than the continuum. Thus there exists a point  $p_\beta \in J_\beta \setminus Q$ . We take  $X = \{p_\alpha: \alpha < \gamma\}$ .

4.2. *If a set  $X \subset E^2$  is dense in  $E^2$ , and  $L \cap X$  contains one point or is empty for every  $L \in L$ , then  $X$  is zero-dimensional.*

*Proof.* Given an arbitrary point  $(x_0, y_0) \in X$  and  $\varepsilon > 0$ , the open set  $\{(x, y): x_0 < x < x_0 + \varepsilon, |y - y_0| > \varepsilon\}$  contains a point  $(a, b)$  of  $X$ . Then the segment  $\{(x, y): x = a, |y - y_0| \leq \varepsilon\}$  is disjoint with  $X$ . It follows that  $(x_0, y_0)$  has arbitrarily small rectangular neighbourhoods whose boundaries lie outside  $X$ .

4.3. *There exists an uncountable zero-dimensional separable metric space which is star-like at each point.*

*Proof.* Let  $X$  be the set from 4.1 with the metric defined by the formula

$$\varrho[(x_1, y_1), (x_2, y_2)] = |x_1 - x_2| + |y_1 - y_2|,$$

which does not change the natural topology. Thus  $(X, \varrho)$  is a zero-dimensional separable metric space, according to 4.2. Suppose that  $o, q$  are two points of  $X$ . Since no line  $L \in L$  passing through  $o$  contains  $q$ , we have a rectangle  $R$  whose sides are segments of  $L \in L$ , and whose opposite vertices are  $o$  and  $q$ . Let  $S$  be the union of two sides of  $R$ , joining  $o$  and  $q$ . Observe that  $\varrho(o, q)$  is the length of  $S$ . Now, if  $0 < \theta < \varrho(o, q)$ , let us consider a point  $p' \in S$  such that the part of  $S$  from  $o$  to  $p'$  has the length  $\theta$ . The arc  $S$  is divided by  $p'$  into two arcs, and at least one of them is a straight line segment  $S' \subset S$  with the end point  $p'$ . Let  $R' \subset R$  be a rectangle such that  $S'$  is a side of  $R'$ . Since  $p'$  is a vertex of  $R'$ , there exists exactly one

line  $M \in \mathcal{M}$  which passes through  $p'$  and intersects the interior of  $R'$ . We find an interior point  $p$  of  $R'$  such that  $p \in M \cap X$ . It is not difficult to check that  $\varrho(o, p) = \theta$  and  $\varrho(o, q) = \theta + \varrho(p, q)$ .

Remark. In view of 3.1, a metric space satisfying 4.3 cannot be complete. However, we do not know whether there exists a non-degenerate zero-dimensional separable metric space which is star-like at each point, and which is topologically complete, i.e. homeomorphic with a complete metric space. Such a space would exist if one could construct a  $G_\delta$  on the plane such that all conditions from 4.1 are fulfilled.

#### References

- [1] A. Lelek and W. Nitka, *On convex metric spaces I*, Fund. Math. 49 (1961), pp. 183-204.  
 [2] Jan Mycielski, *Continuous games with perfect information*, Advances in Game Theory, Annals of Math. Studies 52, Princeton 1964, pp. 103-112.  
 [3] — *A generalization of the Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem*, Notices Amer. Math. Soc. 13 (1966), p. 130.  
 [4] C. Ryll-Nardzewski, *A theory of pursuit and evasion*, Advances in Game Theory, Annals of Math. Studies 52, Princeton 1964, pp. 113-126.

Reçu par la Rédaction le 26. 9. 1966

## Connectivity retracts of finitely coherent Peano continua

by

J. L. Cornette and J. E. Girolo (Ames, Iowa)

The principle result of this paper is

**THEOREM 1.** *Every connectivity retract of a  $k$ -coherent Peano continuum is an  $m$ -coherent Peano continuum, where  $m < k$ .*

An auxiliary result essential to the proof of Theorem 1 is

**LEMMA 1.** *If  $X$  is a  $k$ -coherent Peano continuum and  $H \subset X$  is totally disconnected, then each quasicomponent of  $X - H$  is connected.*

In [3], it is shown that every connectivity retract of a continuum is a continuum, and there is described a Peano continuum (locally connected, metric) which has a connectivity retract that is not a Peano continuum. From Theorem 1, such a continuum must have infinite coherence. In [1], the special case of Theorem 1 for unicoherent continua ( $k = 0$ ) was established. Lemma 1 is the key to the generalization of that argument and should be useful in other results on connectivity functions. One may readily construct examples which show that neither the condition that  $X$  be locally connected nor the condition that  $X$  be finitely coherent nor the condition that  $H$  be totally disconnected may be omitted from the hypothesis of Lemma 1.

In view of Theorem 1 and the fact that for finite polyhedra, the fixed point property is preserved by connectivity retraction ([3], Th. 3.13), we raise the

**QUESTION.** *Is there a  $k$ -coherent Peano continuum that has a connectivity retract that is not a continuous retract?*

**1. Preliminaries.** Let  $X$  and  $Y$  denote topological spaces and  $f: X \rightarrow Y$  a transformation. Then  $f$  is a *connectivity function* if for each connected  $O \subset X$ ,  $\{(x, f(x)): x \in O\}$  is connected in the product space  $X \times Y$ . If  $Y \subset X$  and  $f$  is a connectivity function and for each  $x \in Y$ ,  $f(x) = x$ , then  $Y$  is a *connectivity retract* of  $X$ .