

## On a problem of C. Kuratowski concerning upper semi-continuous collections.

By

J. H. Roberts (Austin, U. S. A.).

In a letter to R. L. Moore dated April 9, 1927, Dr. C. Kuratowski<sup>1)</sup> raised the question as to whether or not there exists an upper semi-continuous collection<sup>2)</sup>  $X$  of mutually exclusive continua no one of which is a point such that (1) the sum of the continua of the collection  $X$  fills a square plus its interior and (2) if each continuum of the collection  $X$  is regarded as a point the space so obtained is in continuous one-to-one correspondence with a square plus its interior. The object of this paper is to answer this question in the affirmative.

I will say that two plane point sets  $G_1$  and  $G_2$  are *equivalent*  $f$  and only if there exists a continuous transformation of the planes into itself which throws  $G_1$  into  $G_2$ . If  $M$  is a point set,  $\bar{M}$  will denote the sum of the points of  $M$  and the limit points of  $M$ . By a *component* of a point set  $G$  is meant a maximal connected subset of  $G$ .

Let  $M$  denote the set of points  $(x, y)$  for which  $0 < x < 1$  and

<sup>1)</sup> See also C. Kuratowski, *Fund. Math.* XI, p. 183, footnote <sup>4)</sup>. This problem may be stated in the following form: define a continuous function  $y = f(x)$  which transforms a square into a square and is such that, for each  $y_0$ , the set of all  $x$ 's such that  $f(x) = y_0$  is a continuum (not reducing to a single point).

<sup>2)</sup> Cf. R. L. Moore, *Concerning upper semi-continuous collections of continua*, *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.* Vol. 27 (1925). Let  $G$  be a collection of bounded continua and suppose that if  $g$  is an element of  $G$  and  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  is a sequence of elements containing points  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$  respectively, such that the sequence  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$  has a sequential limit point in  $g$ , then it follows that every sequence of points  $A_1, A_2, A_3, \dots$ , where for each  $n$   $A_n$  belongs to  $g_n$ , has a sequential limit point in  $g$ . Then the collection  $G$  is said to be *upper semi-continuous*.

$y = \sin 1/x(1 - x)$ . Clearly  $\bar{M}$  is a continuum. Let  $G$  be a non-dense perfect set on the interval  $0 \leq x \leq 1$  of the  $x$ -axis containing the points  $(0, 0)$  and  $(1, 0)$  and with complementary segments  $s_1, s_2, \dots$ , with respect to the interval  $0 \leq x \leq 1$ . For each point  $P$  of  $G$  which is not an end point of any complementary segment of  $G$  let  $V_P$  denote the vertical interval of length 2 with  $P$  as center, and let  $H$  be the collection of all such intervals. Let  $M_n$  be a point set equivalent to  $M$ , and whose limit sets are the vertical intervals 2 units in length which have the end points of the segment  $s_n$  as mid points, and such that (1) no two points of  $M_n$  have the same abscissa, and (2) if  $P(x, y)$  is a point of  $M_n$ , then  $|y| \leq 1$ . Clearly the sum of all the sets  $\bar{M}_1, \bar{M}_2, \dots$ , plus all the intervals of  $H$  is a continuum which I shall call  $K$ . By definition  $K$  is the sum of a collection  $\alpha_K$  of mutually exclusive continua, the elements of  $\alpha_K$  being the intervals of  $H$  and the continua of the sequence  $\bar{M}_1, \bar{M}_2, \dots$ . The collection  $\alpha_K$  is upper semi-continuous and is an arc with respect to its elements. For each continuum  $N$  equivalent to  $K$  there exists a continuous transformation  $T_N$  of  $S$  into itself such that  $T_N(K) = N$ . Let  $\alpha_N$  denote the collection of all point sets  $T_N(g)$  where  $g$  is a continuum of the set  $\alpha_K$ .

The truth of the following lemma may be easily established.

**Lemma:** If  $J$  is a simple closed curve  $AXB CYDA$  such that the arcs  $AXB$  and  $CYD$  of  $J$  are of diameter greater than 1, then there exists a continuum  $N$  equivalent to  $K$ , containing  $AXB$  and  $CYD$  and lying wholly within or on  $J$ , and such that the arcs  $AXB$  and  $CYD$  correspond, under the transformation  $T_N$ , to the end elements of  $\alpha_K$ , and every element of  $\alpha_N$  is of diameter greater than 1.

**Theorem I.** *If  $k$  is any positive number, there exists an upper semi-continuous collection of continua filling the plane, all bounded, all of diameter greater than  $k$ , and no one separating the plane.*

**Proof:** Let  $\gamma_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ) be an arc of diameter greater than 1 which is a subset of  $M_i$ . Let  $T$  denote a transformation of the plane into itself which translates every point vertically upward through a distance of three units. Let  $K_1$  be the image of  $K$  and let  $\beta_i$  ( $i = 1, 2$ ) be the image of  $\gamma_i$  under the translation  $T$ . Let  $J_i$  denote the simple closed curve composed of the arcs  $\gamma_i$  and  $\beta_i$  and the two vertical intervals whose end points are the end points of  $\gamma_i$  and  $\beta_i$ . Let  $N_i$  denote a continuum equivalent to  $K$  such that

the end elements of  $N_i$  are  $\gamma_i$  and  $\beta_i$ , and such that each element of  $\alpha_{N_i}$  is of diameter greater than 1, and all points of  $N_i$  except the points on  $\gamma_i$  and  $\beta_i$  are within  $J_i$ . Let  $H_1$  denote the sum of the continua  $\bar{M}_1$  and  $\bar{M}_2$ , and all elements of  $\alpha_K$  between  $\bar{M}_1$  and  $\bar{M}_2$ ; let  $H_2$  be the image of  $H_1$  under the translation  $T$ . Let  $V_i (i=1, 2)$  be the sum of the continuum  $N_i$  and the elements of  $\alpha_K$  and  $\alpha_{K_i}$  which contain  $\gamma_i$  and  $\beta_i$ . Let  $R$  denote the bounded complementary domain of the continuum  $V_1 + V_2 + H_1 + H_2$ .

Suppose we have defined a collection of continua  $H_1, H_2, \dots, H_n, V_1, V_2, \dots, V_n$  which has the following properties:

Property 1. For each  $k (2 < k \leq n)$  the continuum  $H_k (V_k)$  is a subset of the point set  $R + V_1 + V_2 (R + H_1 + H_2)$ .

Property 2. For each  $i$  not greater than  $n$  the continuum  $H_i (V_i)$  is the sum of the elements of an upper semi-continuous collection  $F_{H_i} (F_{V_i})$  such that (1) each element of  $F_{H_i} (F_{V_i})$  is of diameter greater than 1 and is either a simple continuous arc or a continuum equivalent to  $\bar{M}$ , (2)  $F_{H_i} (F_{V_i})$  is a simple continuous arc with respect to its elements, and (3) the end elements of  $F_{H_i} (F_{V_i})$  are elements of  $F_{V_i}$  and  $F_{H_i} (F_{H_i})$ .

Property 3. For each pair of values of  $i$  and  $j (i \leq n, j \leq n)$  the common part of  $H_i$  and  $V_j$  is an element of  $F_{H_i}$  and an element of  $F_{V_j}$ . If  $i \neq j$  neither  $H_i$  and  $H_j$  nor  $V_i$  and  $V_j$  have a point in common.

Property 4. a) For each bounded complementary domain  $D$  of the continuum  $X_{k-1} (X_{k-1} = V_1 + V_2 + \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} H_i, k > 2)$  there exist two positive integers  $i_D$  and  $j_D (i_D < j_D < k)$  such that the boundary of  $D$  is a subset of  $V_1 + V_2 + H_{i_D} + H_{j_D}$ . If  $k \leq n$  and  $D_{k-1}$  and  $D$  are complementary domains of  $X_{k-1}$  such that  $\bar{D}_{k-1}$  contains  $H_k$ , then  $i_{D_{k-1}} + j_{D_{k-1}} \leq i_D + j_D$ , and each point  $P$  of  $D_{k-1}$  at a distance greater than  $1/(k-1)$  from every point of  $H_{i_{D_{k-1}}}$  is separated from this continuum in  $D_{k-1}$  by the continuum  $H_1$ .

b) For each bounded complementary domain  $D$  of the continuum  $Y_{k-1} (Y_{k-1} = H_1 + H_2 + \sum_{i=1}^{k-1} V_i, k > 2)$  there exist two positive integers  $i_D$  and  $j_D (i_D < j_D < k)$  such that the boundary of  $D$  is a subset of the point set  $H_1 + H_2 + V_{i_D} + V_{j_D}$ . If  $k \leq n$  and  $D_{k-1}$  and  $D$  are complementary domains of  $Y_{k-1}$  such that  $\bar{D}_{k-1}$  contains

$V_k$ , then  $i_{D_{k-1}} + j_{D_{k-1}} \leq i_D + j_D$ , and each point  $P$  of  $D_{k-1}$  at a distance greater than  $1/(k-1)$  from every point of  $V_{i_{D_{k-1}}}$  is separated from this continuum in the domain  $D_{k-1}$  by the continuum  $V_k$ .

Property 5. For every  $i$  not greater than  $n$  every component of  $H_i - H_i \sum_{i=1}^n V_i$ , and every component of  $V_i - V_i \sum_{i=1}^n H_i$  is equivalent to  $H_i - (\bar{M}_1 + \bar{M}_2)$ .

Let  $D_n$  denote a bounded complementary domain of  $X_n (X_n = V_1 + V_2 + \sum_{i=1}^n H_i)$  such that if  $D$  is any other bounded complementary domain of  $X_n$  then  $i_D + j_D \leq i_{D_n} + j_{D_n}$ . Let  $e = i_{D_n}$ . There exists <sup>1)</sup> a simple closed curve  $J_n$  enclosing  $H_i$  but not containing or enclosing any point of any other continuum  $H_j$  for  $j \leq n$ , and furthermore such that every point within  $J_n$  is at a distance less than  $1/n$  from some point of  $H_i$ . For every  $t (t \leq n)$  the simple continuous arc of elements  $F_{V_t}$  contains an element  $\bar{M}_{in}$  such that (1)  $\bar{M}_{in}$  is equivalent to  $\bar{M}$  and (2) if  $Q_{in}$  denotes the element common to  $F_{V_t}$  and  $F_{H_n}$ , then the continuum  $\bar{M}_{in}$  and all elements of  $F_{V_t}$  between  $\bar{M}_{in}$  and  $Q_{in}$  belong to  $D_n$  and to the interior of  $J_n$ . The continuum  $\bar{M}_{in}$  contains an arc  $\gamma_{in}$  of diameter greater than 1 which, under a continuous transformation of  $\bar{M}_{in}$  into  $\bar{M}$  goes into a subset of  $M$ . Let  $S$  be the set of  $n-1$  components of  $D_n - D_n \sum_{i=1}^n V_i$ . For each domain  $G$  of the set  $S$  there exist just two integers  $r_G$  and  $s_G (r_G < s_G \leq n)$  such that the arcs  $\gamma_{r_G}$  and  $\gamma_{s_G}$  are on the boundary of  $G$ . Clearly there exist in  $\bar{G}$  and within  $J_n$  two mutually exclusive arcs which together with  $\gamma_{r_G}$  and  $\gamma_{s_G}$  form a simple closed curve  $J_G$  lying, except for the arcs  $\gamma_{r_G}$  and  $\gamma_{s_G}$  wholly in  $G$ . Let  $N_G$  denote a continuum equivalent to  $K$ , such that every element of  $\alpha_{N_G}$  except  $\gamma_{r_G}$  and  $\gamma_{s_G}$  is a point set of diameter greater than 1 lying wholly within  $J_G$ . Let  $H_{n+1}$  be the sum of all the continua  $N_G$  for each domain  $G$  of the set  $S$ , plus the point set  $(\bar{M}_{1n} + \bar{M}_{2n} + \dots + \bar{M}_{nn})$ .

<sup>1)</sup> See R. L. Moore, *Concerning the separation of point sets by curves*, Proc. Nat. Ac. Sc. Vol. 11 (1925) p. 469, theorem 1.

In an analogous manner I can define  $V_{n+1}$ . Then the collection of continua  $H_1, H_2, \dots, H_n, H_{n+1}, V_1, V_2, \dots, V_n, V_{n+1}$  has properties one to five.

Now the collection  $H_1, H_2, V_1, V_2$  has properties one to five. Hence I have shown the existence of an infinite collection of continua,  $H_1, H_2, \dots; V_1, V_2, \dots$  such that for every positive integer  $n$  ( $n \geq 2$ ) the subcollection  $H_1, H_2, \dots, H_n, V_1, V_2, \dots, V_n$  has properties one to five. From property 4 it readily follows that if  $P$  is any point of  $R$  not belonging to the continuum  $H_n$  ( $V_n$ ) then there exists an integer  $k$  ( $t$ ) such that the continuum  $H_k$  ( $V_t$ ) separates  $P$  from  $H_n$  ( $V_n$ ) in the domain  $R$ .

Let  $P$  denote any point whatsoever of  $R$ . Consider every continuum  $S$  which does not contain  $P$  and which is for some  $n$  a subset of the continuum  $\sum_{i=1}^n (H_i + V_i)$ . For each such continuum  $S$  let  $G_{SP}$  denote the complementary domain of  $S$  which contains  $P$ . Let  $T_P$  denote the common part of all the domains  $G_{SP}$  for every continuum  $S$ . It is easily seen that  $T_P$  is the common part of a countable infinity of domains  $G_1, G_2, \dots$  of which  $G_n$  contains  $\bar{G}_{n+1}$ . Hence  $T_P$  is a continuum. Since for every  $n$  the boundary of  $G_n$  contains a subset of diameter greater than 1 the domain  $G_n$  itself is of diameter greater than 1. Hence the continuum  $T_P$  is of diameter greater than or equal to 1.

Obviously if  $P$  and  $Q$  are points, either  $T_P$  and  $T_Q$  are identical or they have no point in common. Let  $X$  denote the collection of all continua  $T_P$  for every point  $P$  of  $R$ . Let  $h$  denote a continuum of the collection  $X$  containing the point  $A$ , and  $h_1, h_2, \dots$  a sequence of such continua, containing the points  $A_1, A_2, \dots$  respectively, such that  $A$  is the sequential limit point of the sequence  $A_1, A_2, \dots$ . Let  $g$  be any continuum of the collection  $X$  except  $h$ . Since  $h$  and  $g$  are distinct, by definition of  $h$  there exists a continuum  $S$  which does not contain any point of  $h$ , and such that complementary domain of  $S$  which does contain  $h$  does not contain  $g$ . However this domain must contain all but a finite number of the continua  $h_1, h_2, \dots$ . Therefore the continuum  $g$  cannot contain a limit point of any sequence of points  $Q_1, Q_2, \dots$  where  $Q_n$  belongs to  $h_n$ . Hence the collection  $X$  is upper semi-continuous.

I have therefore shown the existence of an upper semi-continuous collection of continua filling up the domain  $R$ , each continuum

of this collection being of diameter greater than or equal to 1, and no one of them separating the plane. Now if  $k$  is any positive number there exists a continuous one-to-one correspondence between the points of the domain  $R$  and the whole plane which is such that if  $x$  and  $y$  are two points of  $R$ , the distances between their images is greater than  $k$  times their distance in the domain  $R$ . Obviously the image of a continuum in  $R$  is a continuum in the plane, and the collection corresponding to  $X$  satisfies the conclusion of theorem I.

**Theorem II.** *If  $G$  denotes a) the Euclidean plane, b) a simple closed curve plus its interior, or (3) a sphere, there exists, an upper semi-continuous collection  $T$  of mutually exclusive continua such that (1) each point of  $G$  belongs to some continuum of the collection  $T$ , (2) there exists a positive number  $k$  such that each continuum of the collection  $T$  is of diameter greater than  $k$ , and (3) if the continua of the collection  $T$  are regarded as points the space so obtained is in continuous one-to-one correspondence with the point set  $G$ .*

**Proof:** a) If  $G$  is a plane, let  $T$  be any collection of continua satisfying the conclusion of theorem I. Then <sup>1)</sup> the collection  $T$  satisfies the conclusion of theorem II.

b) Consider the domain  $R$  of theorem I. If  $P$  is a point of  $R$  let  $I_P$  denote the set of all positive integers  $i$  for which  $(H_i + V_i)$  does not contain  $P$ , and let  $T_P$  denote that component of  $\bar{R} - \sum_{i \in I_P} (H_i + V_i)$  which contains  $P$ . Clearly  $T_P$  is a continuum not separating the plane and of diameter not less than 1. By a method similar to that given in the proof of theorem I it can be shown that the collection  $Y$  of all continua  $T_P$  for each point  $P$  of  $\bar{R}$  is an upper semi-continuous collection of mutually exclusive continua. There exists a simple closed curve  $J$  such that (1)  $J$  incloses the domain  $R$ , and (2) if  $D$  is a bounded complementary domain of  $J + \bar{R}$ , there exists a continuum  $y_D$  of the collection  $Y$  such that the boundary of  $D$  contains no point of  $\bar{R} - y_D$ . For each continuum  $y$  of  $Y$  let  $t_y$  be the continuum  $y + (\bar{D}_{1y} + \bar{D}_{2y} + \dots)$  where the sequence  $D_{1y}, D_{2y}, \dots$  consists of those bounded complementary domains of  $J + \bar{R}$  which have a point of  $y$  on their bound-

<sup>1)</sup> See R. L. Moore, *Concerning upper semi-continuous collections of continua*, pp. 416-428.

aries. Let  $T$  denote the collection of all continua  $t_i$  for each continuum  $y$  of the collection  $Y$ . It can easily be shown that  $T$  is an upper semi-continuous collection of mutually exclusive continua. Let  $Z$  denote the collection of all continua of the collection  $T$ , and all points outside the simple closed curve  $J$ . There exists<sup>1)</sup> a continuous one-to-one correspondence between the continua of  $Z$  and the points of a Euclidean plane. It readily follows that the subset of the plane which corresponds to  $J$  plus its interior is a simple closed curve plus its interior. If  $G$  is any simple closed curve plus its interior there exists a continuous transformation of the plane into itself which maps  $J$  plus its interior on  $G$ . Clearly the collection of continua corresponding to  $T$  under such a transformation satisfies the conclusion of theorem II.

c) From the viewpoint of analysis situs a hemisphere is equivalent to a simple closed curve plus its interior. Hence the truth of the last part of theorem II readily follows from the truth of the second part.

<sup>1)</sup> See E. L. Moore, loc. cit.

University of Texas, Nov. 2, 1928.

## Continuous curves and arc-sums<sup>1)</sup>.

By

G. T. Whyburn (Austin, U. S. A.).

Menger<sup>2)</sup> has suggested the problem of characterizing a continuous curve which is the sum of a countable number of simple continuous arcs. In this paper two theorems will be proved along the line of this problem. The first of these reduces the problem for a continuous curve  $M$  in general to the same problem concerning the maximal cyclic curves of  $M$ ; and together these two theorems give a considerable amount of new information, and at the same time yield as corollaries most of the known results connected with this problem.

By a *continuous curve* is meant any connected im kleinen continuum. A continuous curve  $C$  is *cyclicly connected*<sup>3)</sup> if and only if every two of its points lie together on some simple closed curve in  $C$ . A *maximal cyclic curve*<sup>3)</sup> of a continuous curve  $M$  is a sub-continuous curve of  $M$  which is saturated with respect to the property of being cyclicly connected. The theorems below hold true in any locally compact, metric, and separable space.

<sup>1)</sup> Presented to the American Mathematical Society, December 23, 1928.

<sup>2)</sup> K. Menger, *Über reguläre Baumkurven*, Math. Ann., vol. 96 (1926), pp. 572—582, see footnote to p. 578. Menger states the problem only for regular curves, a special type of continuous curve.

<sup>3)</sup> Cf. my papers *Cyclicly connected continuous curves*, Proc. Ntl. Acad. of Sci., vol. 13 (1927), pp. 31—38, and *Concerning the structure of a continuous curve*, Amer. Journal Math., vol. 50 (1928), pp. 167—194. Extensions of most of the results in the former paper to  $n$  dimensions have been made by W. L. Ayres; cf. his forthcoming paper *Concerning continuous curves in space of  $n$  dimensions*.